| **Student Name:** Dominic Gao |
| --- |

| **Motion:** This house supports tough on crime laws when combating organised criminal groups (e.g. gangs, mafia organisations) |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| **Teacher comments:**  [NOTE: Today’s speeches are 7 minutes’ long.]  The hook could focus a lot more on the human costs of organised criminal syndicates or explain precisely how prevalent the problem is, rather than just a broad preference to pop culture.  On the failures of the status quo:   * Aside from saying the status quo clearly does not work, explain precisely why that’s the case and why the reason why Opp fails at this doesn’t apply to you. * Good reinforcement on why the powers given to Prop enables us to crackdown on the syndicates. Be more specific and give me the grounding!   + For example, we will allow the police to wiretap without a court warrant, but the Opp has to jump through hoops to gain approval in which time the organised crime can get away with the crime. * It isn’t clear why financial motivations are addressed by your deterrent effect, we need some stakeholder analysis from the perspective of these pawns. Actively weigh which is more persuasive to them.   We need to rebut Emi’s arguments on pawns being the most heavily punished while the overlords get away with the crimes.   * So expand the legal justification to prove that the pawns are often the ones with the most blood on their hands, so they still deserve the highly deterrent punishments.   Engage with her countermodel of rehabilitation and tell me why it won’t work specifically in the case of organised crime.   * These pawns never had criminal intention to begin with, so rehab was never going to work.   On the mechanistic analysis, spend more time on each one of them to prove effectiveness:   * Expand more on the fact that tough on crime laws can impose a penalty on bystanders, so people who witness no longer stay silent as they fear incarceration more than they fear the intimidation of these criminal groups.   + Good analysis on the feeling of safety post-reporting, but bear in mind the larger group still exists to retaliate against you even if you report just one of them * On the underfunding of law enforcement, it isn’t clear why Opp cannot just co-opt all of this.   + This is also not part of your Prop fiat. If law enforcement officers are underpaid, then tough on crime laws do nothing to address the underlying problem and financial incentives.   On the lower degree of trust, this often happens due to corruption and bribery which allows syndicates to control the police.   * So tough on crime laws do not actively address the fact that syndicates have a lot of wealth that they leverage to buy over cops.   Please offer more POIs today!  7.03 | | | | | | |